

1 WILMER CUTLER PICKERING HALE
AND DORR LLP

2 John A. Rogovin (pro hac vice)
Randolph D. Moss (pro hac vice)
3 Samir C. Jain # 181572
Brian M. Boynton # 222193
4 Catherine M.A. Carroll (pro hac vice)
1875 Pennsylvania Ave, NW
5 Washington, DC 20006
Tel.: 202-663-6000
6 Fax: 202-663-6363
Email: john.rogovin@wilmerhale.com

7
8 Randal S. Milch
Verizon Communications Inc.
One Verizon Way
9 VC43E043
Basking Ridge, NJ 07920
10 Tel.: 908-559-1752
Fax: 908-696-2136

11 Attorneys for Verizon Communications Inc.,
12 Verizon Global Networks Inc., and MCI, LLC

MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP

Henry Weissmann # 132418
Susan R. Szabo # 155315
Aimee A. Feinberg # 223309
355 South Grand Avenue
35th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071-1560
Tel.: 213-683-9100
Fax: 213-683-5150
Email: Henry.Weissmann@mto.com

13 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
14
15 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
16
17 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

17 IN RE:

18 NATIONAL SECURITY AGENCY
19 TELECOMMUNICATIONS
20 RECORDS LITIGATION

21 This Document Relates To:

22 No. 06-220 (D.R.I.)
No. 1:06-cv-632 (E.D. Cal.)
No. cv-06-77 (D. Mont.)
23 No. 06-2491 (D. La.)
No. cv-06-694 (D. Ore.)
24 No. 1:06-cv-2680 (N.D. Ill.)
No. 06-224 (D.R.I.)
25 No. 3:06-cv-3574 (N.D. Cal.)
26 No. 3:06-cv-4221 (N.D. Cal.)

MDL NO. 06-1791 VRW

**SUPPLEMENTAL DECLARATION OF
JOSEPH P. DUNBAR IN SUPPORT OF
VERIZON'S MOTION TO DISMISS FOR
LACK OF PERSONAL JURISDICTION**

[Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(2)]

Hearing Date: August 30, 2007
Time: 2:00 p.m.
Courtroom: 6 (17th floor)
Judge: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

1 I, Joseph P. Dunbar, declare as follows:

2 1. I am the Director of Administrative Reporting for Verizon Business Network
3 Services, Inc. I make this supplemental declaration in support of Verizon's Motion To Dismiss for
4 Lack of Personal Jurisdiction. The facts stated herein are based upon my own personal knowledge,
5 informed by a review of corporate records of Verizon Communications Inc., MCI, LLC and its
6 corporate predecessors, and Verizon Global Networks Inc. and interviews with knowledgeable
7 persons. If called to testify, I could and would testify competently to the facts set forth below.

8
9 **VERIZON COMMUNICATIONS INC.**

10 2. Verizon Communications Inc. ("VCI") is a Delaware corporation with its corporate
11 headquarters at 140 West Street, New York, NY 10007. As I indicated in the declaration I submitted
12 on April 30, 2007 in support of Verizon's Motion To Dismiss for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction, VCI
13 is a holding company. I have undertaken an additional inquiry and reconfirmed that VCI owns or
14 leases no property, provides no services, and has no employees in California, Illinois, Montana,
15 Oregon, or Rhode Island. In fact, VCI has fewer than 30 employees, all of whom work in New
16 Jersey or New York.

17 3. I have also reconfirmed that VCI has never been registered or otherwise qualified to
18 do business in California, Illinois, Montana, Oregon, or Rhode Island, and it has not appointed an
19 agent for service of process in these states. VCI is a corporate entity distinct from Verizon
20 Communications, Inc. (with a comma in the name). Verizon Communications, Inc. (with a comma)
21 is the successor to Verizon, Inc., which was incorporated in Delaware on December 7, 1999, for the
22 sole purpose of holding the name "Verizon" until after the Bell Atlantic/GTE merger was
23 completed. That merger was effective on June 30, 2000. Verizon, Inc. changed its name to Verizon
24 Communications, Inc. (with a comma) on March 27, 2000. Effective September 22, 2000, Verizon
25 Communications, Inc. (with a comma) was merged into Bell Atlantic Corporation, which was the
26 surviving corporation and which then changed its name to Verizon Communications Inc.

27 4. On December 14, 1999, before the merger of Bell Atlantic and GTE, Verizon, Inc.
28 registered with the Oregon Secretary of State. This registration is reflected in Exhibit 33 to the

1 Declaration of Vincent I. Parrett dated June 22, 2007 (“Parrett Declaration”). On March 30, 2000,
2 Verizon, Inc. amended its registration to show its new name, Verizon Communications, Inc. (with a
3 comma). This amendment is also reflected in Exhibit 33 to the Parrett Declaration. The corporate
4 entity that was registered with the Oregon Secretary of State was distinct from VCI, as explained
5 above. VCI has never been registered to do business in Oregon.

6 5. Similarly, Verizon Communications, Inc. (with a comma) was registered with the
7 California Secretary of State prior to the merger of Bell Atlantic and GTE. Verizon
8 Communications, Inc. (with a comma) surrendered its registration, however, following the merger.
9 That registration and surrender are reflected in Exhibit 26 to the Parrett Declaration. The corporate
10 entity that was registered with the California Secretary of State was distinct from VCI, as explained
11 above. VCI has never been registered to do business in California.

12 6. Neither Verizon, Inc. nor Verizon Communications, Inc. (with a comma) ever sold,
13 marketed, or provided goods or services of any kind. Neither company ever conducted any business
14 in California or Oregon, had offices in California or Oregon, owned any real estate in California or
15 Oregon, or had any employees in California or Oregon.

16 7. VCI does not own, operate, or determine the content of the website found at
17 www22.verizon.com. That website is owned and operated, and its content is determined, by
18 subsidiaries of VCI, not by VCI itself. When a customer signs up for a product or service on the
19 website, the customer is directed to the appropriate operating subsidiary of VCI.

20 8. I have also reconfirmed that VCI does not advertise. Advertising for products and
21 services offered by VCI subsidiaries is contracted and paid for by subsidiaries of VCI, not by VCI
22 itself. The costs of advertising are paid for or allocated to the relevant Verizon operating company.
23 None of the advertising costs are paid for or allocated to VCI.

24 9. VCI does pay for some lobbying in California, but contrary to Plaintiffs’ assertions
25 (at p. 11 of their opposition brief), it has not “spent over \$6 million lobbying in California” since
26 2001. California lobbying expenses are paid for in the first instance by a subsidiary of VCI, Verizon
27 Corporate Services Group Inc., a subsidiary that provides services to VCI and its subsidiaries. The
28 costs of lobbying are then allocated to the various Verizon companies on whose behalf the lobbying

1 is conducted. Based on a review of VCI's reported California lobbying expenditures and internal
2 cost allocation procedures, it is estimated that from 2002 through the first quarter of 2007,
3 approximately 11% of the expenditures for California lobbying were allocated to VCI. The
4 lobbying conducted in California is overseen and directed by employees of Verizon Corporate
5 Services Group Inc.

6 10. VCI is not a certificated public utility in California.
7

8 **MCI, LLC AND ITS CORPORATE PREDECESSORS**

9 11. MCI, LLC^{1/} is a Delaware limited liability company with its headquarters at One
10 Verizon Way in Basking Ridge, New Jersey. As I indicated in the declaration I submitted on April
11 30, 2007 in support of Verizon's Motion To Dismiss for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction, MCI, LLC is
12 a holding company. I have undertaken an additional inquiry and reconfirmed that MCI, LLC owns
13 or leases no property, provides no services, and has no employees in California.

14 12. I indicated in my prior declaration of April 30, 2007 that neither MCI, Inc. nor
15 WorldCom, Inc. ever maintained offices in California. I have reconfirmed that fact. In 2004 and
16 2005, however, a subsidiary of WorldCom, Inc. and then MCI, Inc. called MCI WorldCom Network
17 Services, Inc. leased office space at 201 Spear Street, San Francisco, CA 94105. William Harrelson
18 and Richard Severy, who signed the disclosure forms attached as Exhibits 38 through 41 to the
19 Parrett declaration, worked at that address in those years and were not employees of MCI, Inc. or
20 WorldCom, Inc.
21

22 **VERIZON GLOBAL NETWORKS INC.**

23 13. Verizon Global Networks Inc. is a Delaware corporation with its corporate
24 headquarters at One Verizon Way in Basking Ridge, New Jersey. Verizon Global Networks Inc.
25
26

27 ^{1/} MCI, LLC changed its name to Verizon Business Global LLC effective November 21, 2006.
28 This declaration, however, uses the prior name because that is the name Plaintiffs have used in their complaint.

1 offers services to affiliated telephone carriers in the wholesale market. It does not provide
2 telecommunications services to individuals.

3 14. In my prior declaration filed April 30, 2007, I indicated that Verizon Global
4 Networks Inc. does not provide any services, does not own or lease property, has never been
5 registered or otherwise qualified to do business, and has not appointed an agent for service of
6 process in Louisiana. In their opposition brief, Plaintiffs point out that Verizon Global Networks
7 Inc. is qualified to do business in Louisiana and maintains an agent for service of process there.
8 Upon further examination of this issue, I have determined that certain statements in my declaration
9 were incorrect and that Verizon Global Networks Inc. owns property, provides wholesale services, is
10 qualified to do business, maintains an agent for service of process, and remains in active and good
11 standing in Louisiana.

12
13 I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

14 Executed on August 3, 2007.

/s/ Joseph P. Dunbar

15 _____
16 Joseph P. Dunbar

17
18 I hereby attest that I have on file a holograph signature for the signature above indicated by a
19 “conformed” signature (/s/).

20 /s/ Brian M. Boynton

21 _____
22 Brian M. Boynton